

CONTACT INFORMATION

Kevin McCarthy, Planning Associate II, kmccarthy@columbiatn.com 931-560-1531

DOCKET/CASE/APPLICATION NUMBER

22-0209

APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER

John Totty

HEARING DATE

N/A

PROPERTY ADDRESS/LOCATION

924 S Main

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness to improve the façade of a non-contributing structure located near the corner of East 9th and South Main Street. The subject property was constructed sometime around 1900, but it is not listed in the 1984 inventory. It has likely been altered repeatedly. Proposed modifications include replacement of glazing and entryway, and painting.



| EXISTING ZONING | EXISTING LAND USE | SURROUNDING ZONING & LAND USE | SITE IMPROVEMENTS | Historic District |
|-----------------|-------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|
| CD-5 | Vacant Commercial | CD-5 | Exterior Alterations | Downtown |

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE

APPROVE WITH CONDITIONS

DENY

DEFER

Review Status and History

Submission Status: First request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for this address.

Previous Approvals: N/A

1984 Historic Properties Inventory Details: N/A

Proposed Alterations

Renovation of façade to include:

- Replace windows with white aluminum clad windows.
- Replace door with composite partially glazed unit.
- Repaint “masonry based wall covering” (not brick) with Benjamin Moore Cromwell Grey.

Historic District Design Guidelines Referenced

Staff reviewed the proposed alterations for consistency with the *City of Columbia Historic Design Guidelines* for commercial renovations. The relevant sections of Guidelines are listed below; the most applicable standards are **bolded** and underlined. Staff comments follow at the end of each section.

5.8 Retain Character and Finish of Historic Wall Surfaces

- b. The visibility of historic wall surfaces shall be maintained. Covering or replacing historic surfaces with synthetic sidings, stucco, veneers, or other materials where they did not historically exist is not appropriate. Chemical applications that alter the color or texture of historic surfaces are prohibited.
- c. The character of wall surfaces shall be maintained by retaining and preserving claddings, corbelling, quoins, cornices, and other distinguishing features.
- f. Where present, historic exterior claddings shall be replaced only when original materials are deteriorated beyond repair. New claddings shall match the original in scale, profile, and finish as closely as possible so as to minimize impacts to the building’s character.

P. 5-10, 5-11 Commercial Storefront Guidelines

- d. [Regarding Entrances] Storefront entrances are the first point of interaction with the public and shall be maintained as part of well-configured storefront systems that capture the historic character of the area. Historic entries shall be retained at the building face unless a historic exterior alcove exists, and doors shall be retained, maintained, and repaired in accordance with the guidelines. Balancing compatibility with historical precedents and code requirements is critical when replacing deteriorated doors that are no longer serviceable.

5.15 Maintain Compatibility When Selecting Replacement Doors

- a. Historic doors shall only be replaced when they are deteriorated beyond repair. If deterioration is confined to a specific element or feature, only the damaged component shall be replaced. Total replacement of an entire assembly is prohibited when only localized deterioration is present.
- b. New doors shall fit the original opening. Visibly enlarging or reducing an opening for a new door is prohibited.
- c. When replacing existing historic doors, new doors shall be compatible with the size, proportions, glazing, and configuration of the existing door. In kind materials are strongly encouraged. Alternative materials will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.



- d. **When replacing non-original doors, new doors shall be compatible with the character and style of the building as well as traditional precedents in the district. Residential doors are prohibited on commercial buildings unless the building has been converted from residential use.**

5.16 Maintain Compatibility When Storefront Windows Require Replacement

- e. Deteriorated but serviceable elements such as framing members, piers, transoms, and bulkheads shall be repaired.
- f. Damaged historic glass shall be replaced with new glass that matches the clarity of the original and fits the original opening.
- g. **When replacement of a window unit is necessary, new units shall match the original in size, proportions, character, and finish as closely as possible. Replaced framing members shall be visually compatible with the scale, spacing, texture, and profile of the storefront.**

Historic District Design Guidelines Referenced

Staff Comment:

- It is within the discretion of the Commission to determine whether the proposed modifications conform to the Guidelines.
- The applicant's submittal does not specify the cladding material and other details about the improvements.
- Staff recommends that the commission discuss the proposed alteration with the applicant, provide suggestions for improvements, and defer action to its next meeting in order to allow the applicant to revise the proposal.

Recommendation

Table for Future Consideration

Recommended Motion:

Move to find that there is insufficient information to make a decision, table the application, and request that the applicant provide: [list additional information] for review at a future meeting.

Alternative Motions:

Alternative Motion [Approve]:

Move to approve issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness and find that the proposed renovation conforms to the Historic District Design Guidelines.

Alternative Motion [Approve Subject to Conditions]:

Move to approve issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness and find that the proposed renovation conforms to the Historic District Design Guidelines subject to the following conditions: [list conditions of approval].

Alternative Motion [Deny]:

Move to find that the proposed renovation is not compatible with the Historic District Design Guidelines, and deny issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness [list reasons for denial].